COMPARISON OF PROPOSED CONCEPT POWERED, AIR-PURIFYING RESPIRATOR (PAPR) STANDARDS FOR INDUSTRIAL, WMD, AND CBRN CLASSIFICATIONS

5/30/05

PAPR STANDARD	INDUSTRIAL	WMD (name to change)	CBRN
PAPR types	Respiratory inlet covering: (Tight fit or loose fit) @ 3 flow rates: Low, Moderate, High	Tight fit or loose fit @ 2 flow rates (Low and Moderate)	Tight fit only @ 2 flow rates (Moderate and High)
Approval types	Approved per: Protections as requested + inlet covering (Tight or loose fit) + IDLH w. O ₂ , , non-IDLH escapes + Flow rates (Low, Med, High)	Approved Per: Single protection- CBRN + Tight or loose fit + NOT for IDLH escape + Flow rates (Low, Med)	Approved Per: Single protection- CBRN + Tight fit only + IDLH w. O ₂ , non-IDLH escapes + Flow rates (Med, High)
Environments	TIGHT FIT Entry in characterized Escape from characterized or uncharacterized with sufficient O2 LOOSE FIT Entry in characterized Escape with only from characterized- unit must be removed	TIGHT FIT Entry in characterized Escape only from characterized LOOSE FIT (same as TIGHT) Entry in characterized Escape only from characterized	TIGHT FIT Entry in characterized Escape from characterized or uncharacterized with sufficient O2 No LOOSE FIT
Pressure type	Positive or non-positive pressure	Positive or non-positive pressure	Positive pressure only
General test condition	Test at max flow	Same	Same
Filter type	Hi efficiency filter (PAPR 100) Base filter (PAPR 95)	PAPR 100 only	PAPR 100 only
Cartridge/canister usage	Cartridges, canisters, or filters sealed in original packaging until	Same	Same

DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT

	used		
Agent exposure	Not Applicable	Not designed for liquid agent expose	If liquid agent exposed- disposed of after
	Not approved for any agent exposure	If exposure occurs, dispose of immediately	use
Gas/vapor approval	Approved for gas families via TRAs	Approved for gas families via TRAs	Approved for gas families via TRAs (Test
categories	(Test Representative Agents) + additional industrial chemicals	(Test Representative Agents) only	Representative Agents) only
Part 84 requirements	General provisions Subparts A, B, C	Same except subpart C	Same except subpart C
	(fees), D, E, F, G unless specified	Fees specified separately	Fees specified separately
Containers/packaging conditioning	No environmental conditioning	No environmental conditioning	Environmental conditioning in min packaging
Rough handling	No rough handling requirement	Canister rough handling since uses CBRN canister	Canister rough handling
Labeling	Label-Battery part number on battery pack AND other suitable location if not visible + list battery service life (run time)	Same	Same
Labeling- additional	Label- Additional C&L's as required	Same	Same
Battery life use time	Battery life in 60 min increments	Same	Same
Battery indicators	Battery life indicator- may be passive	Same	Same
Battery life	None	None	Battery- expiration date
Battery alert	Low Battery- 15 min low battery life alert- Must readily detectable without manipulation of the respirator	Same	Same
Battery operation time	Continue to perform properly 15 minutes after rated time at min. specified op. temp.	Same	Same
Low air flow or low	Must readily detectable without	Same	Same
pressure indicator	manipulation of the respirator		
	Test at min specified op temp & 25C		
System flow -	CONSTANT FLOW	Low and Moderate only	Moderate and High only
minimum flow	Light flow (work) rating		
requirements	Tight fit >= 85lpm????		

DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT

Test performed on most restrictive cartridge/canister/filter configuration	Loose fit>= 115 lpm???? to be determined Moderate flow rating Tight fit >= 115 lpm Loose fit>= 170 lpm High flow rating Tight fit >= 261 lpm for final 10 minutes of specified operation time Loose fit >= 350 lpm for final 10 minutes of specified operation time BREATH RESPONSE (tight fit only) Low flow rating >=14.5 res./min @ 10.5 L/min. vol. Moderate flow rating >=24res./min.@ 40 L/min High flow rating >= 30 res./min. @ 86 LPM + 30 res./min @ 103 L/min for final 10 minutes of specified operation time		
Non-powered system resistance	No requirement: FMEA Failure Modes and Effects Analysis used	Same	Same
Vision	Field of View Score >=90 on med. Size	Same	Same
Vision- haze	Haze <= 3%	Same	Same
Vision-luminous trans	Luminous Trans >= 88%	Same	Same
Abrasion	Optional: Abrasion res-	Optional: Abrasion res-	Required
	haze increase <=4%	haze increase <=4%	
CO2 testing- Machine	CO2- Machine test Inhaled <= 1% 14.5 res.p.m.	Same	Same

DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT

	10.57.50/		
	10.5L 5%		
	CO2 inhaled.		
CO2 and O2- Human	CO2 & O2 Human Subject	Same	Same
subject	<=2%		
	O2 >= 19.5%		
	@ 3.5 mph walk		
Hydration devices	Hydration (if present)	Same	Same
(optional)	75mm H2O suction		
	Leakage <= 30 mL/min		
Sound	Noise <= 80 dBA	Same	Same
Gas/vapor testing	Gas/Vapor Test ppm Break	Same Except for	Same Except for
concentration:	- Through ppm	Carbon Mon.	Carbon Mon.
per system		Ethylene Oxide	Ethylene Oxide
	Ammonia 2500 25	Methyl Amine	Methyl Amine
Testing per cartridge or	Cyanogen Chl. 300		
canister performed at	Cyclohexane 2600 10		
highest flow rate of	Formaldehyde 500 1		
respirator system on	Hyd. Cyanide 940 4.7		
which cartridges or	Hyd Sulfide 1000 10		
canisters will be used	Nitrogen Dio 200 1NO2,		
divided by number or	25 NO		
cartridges or canisters	Phosgene 250 1.25		
	Phosphine 300 0.3		
Concentration	Sulfur Dio 1500 5		
calculation:			
Test concentration=	INDUSTRIAL ONLY		
PEL X APF of 50 X	Carbon Mon. 18000 35		
safety factor of 10.	Ethylene Oxi. 5000 1		
	Methyl Amine 5000 10		
Breakthrough = PEL.			
Ethylene Oxide	NOTE: Industrial may choose any	NOTE: CBRN must be approved for	NOTE: CBRN must be approved for all
calculated at 10 X	combinations of protections.	all protections above dashed line	protections above dashed line shown in
concentration and 10X		shown in industrial column	industrial column

DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT

breakthrough for			
laboratory purposes.			
Gas/vapor test conditions	Gas/Vapor Test conditions Not preconditioned Tested at 25% & 85% RH	Same	Same
Gas/vapor test time	Test concentration X rated minutes (in 60 min intervals)	Gas/Vapor Test Time: 60 min	Gas/Vapor Test Time: Test concentration X rated minutes (in 15 min intervals)
Gas/vapor test flows	Performed on cartridge or canister at max flow rate of system on which it will be used divided by number of cartridges or canisters	Performed at max flow rate of system on which it will be used	Gas/Vapor Test Flow (canister system) Constant, Moderate 100 lpm Constant, High 261 lpm Demand, Moderate 115 lpm Demand, High 300 lpm
Particulate testing concentration: per system	Particulate PAPR 95 & PAPR 100 PAPR 95- DOP –initial penetration PAPR 100- DOP- 200 mg loading 20 canisters tested 95.0% or 99.97% efficiency +6 after cyclohexane if used in conjunction with OV protection	Particulate DOP- 200 mg 20 canisters 99.97% eff. after cond. +6 after cyclohexane	Particulate PAPR 100 only plus +6 after cyclohexane
Particulate test conditioning	Tested as received	Test following environmental conditioning	Test following environmental conditioning
Particulate test time	PAPR 95- DOP -instantaneous PAPR 100- DOP- 200 mg loading then test until no further degradation	PAPR 100- Same	PAPR 100- Same
Particulate test flows	Performed at max flow rate of system on which it will be used	Same	Same
Crisis Provision	Not required	Not required	Panic demand - Canister Hi flow: 5 min @ 100-135 lpm (note: would be the same as constant moderate w.

DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT DRAFT

			1-canister PAPR -OR- Br. Machine @ 114 lpm & peak flow rate @ 360 lpm
Resistance of Cartridge/canister/filter	Resistance in parallel: +-10%	Same	Same
Canister uniformity system service test	None	System service Test w. cyclo., SO2, Cyan. Chl. & Phos. On manifold	System service Test w. cyclo., SO2, Cyan. Chl. & Phos. On manifold
Fogging	Fogging- low temp VAS >= 75 at min temp specified by applicant	Same except at -21C	Same except at -21C
Communications	None required	Communications: >=70%	Communications: >=70%
Agent testing	None required	LAT (same)	LAT
Fit testing	LRPL value of 10,000 proposed	Same but value may be revised	Same but value may be revised
Environmental conditioning	None	None	Durability Hot, cold, vibration, drop
QA	QA per 42 CFR 84	Same	Same
Practical Performance	Determined as part of LRPL	Same	Same
Electronic component analysis	FMEA (Failure Modes and Effects Analysis)	Same	Same
Intrinsic safety (optional)	Intrinsic safety- Part 18 or recognized independent lab	Same	Same
ESLI (optional)	ESLI- per present requirement	Not applicable	Not applicable
Shelf life (optional)	Mfr. may list shelf life of components	Same	Same
Valve leakage	Per Part 84 existing requirements	Same	Same
Total system leakage	Determined via LRPL	Same	Same

PAPR COMPARE May 2005